

Transformative Research Space Through Epistemic Indeterminacy of Mandala

Suresh Gautam* 

School of Education, Kathmandu University, Lalitpur, Nepal

Abstract

The paper aims to explore how local epistemologies are emerged from the indeterminacy of the position and momentum of the researcher. Using the symbol of Mandala, I depict such indeterminacy during the research process, which eventually fosters transformative research space. I researched on urban youth of Kathmandu and their everyday life during 2012-2016. During the research, I was engaged with some youth in Kathmandu for understanding their ways of being and living over there. Despite being guided by particular epistemologies, I sought some local epistemologies from the narratives of my participants, which not only guided my research process but also demonstrated indefinite nature of reality. It helped me to understand the everyday life of urban youth in Kathmandu. In so doing, here, I reflect the research process which interacts with other epistemic indeterminacy around Mandala. Mandala in the Eastern (Hindu and Buddhist) tradition is known as a representation of a complex web of human life and activities, which portrays the mesocosm of everyday life of urban youth as integral part of time and space.

Keywords: Transformative Research Space; Local Epistemologies; Ways of Being and Living; Mandala

Pre Script: Mandala Orientation

Mandala is a Sanskrit term which literally refers to a circle. However, we can see other various kinds of shapes such as triangle and squares in a mandala. I have been using mandala as “plans, charts, geometric patterns, or all sorts of artistic designs that are circular, where squares and other figures may be incorporated” (Sattler, 2008, p. 49). Circle in a mandala represents the circle of the universe which connects both microcosm and mesocosm (Longchenpa, 2001). This notion of mandala in this research is used to connect the microcosm and mesocosm of everyday life of urban youth in Kathmandu. I presented the entire belief systems of urban youth with the help of the patterns of a mandala. These patterns are symbolic and often interpreted by the local cosmological thinking.

Literally, in Sanskrit, Mandala means secret circle and center—the symbol of the cosmos in its entirety, while the square is the symbol of the Earth and human-made world (Malandra, 1993). Its traditional design hence often consists of a series of concentric forms, suggestive of a passage between different dimensions (Brauen, 2009). In this essence, it pertains not only to the Earth but also to the macrocosm and microcosm, the largest structural processes as well as the smallest. It is the gatepost between the two. Thereby the mandala is a living structural matrix subjected to the infinite processes of growth and transformation by the virtue of the ever-changing relationships, both internal and external to its basic structure (Arguelles & Arguelles, 1972). The center is the beginning of the mandala, the origin of all forms and processes, and ultimately the eternal potential. Expanding from its center, mandala is a manifestation, reflecting human consciousness and perception of the universe in their present time, which continually appeared in rituals and art forms throughout history.

I used the notion of five deity mandala as the analytical tool of the field text. Among many types of five deity mandala, each shared common features with central sacral area, which is surrounded by a square, which are entrance gates (Brauen, 2009). The most important elements of a mandala form are designed to work together to bring the harmony of body and mind, microcosm and macrocosm, cosmos and physical world. Reflecting on my work, four key elements appeared dominant in my research. First they are bindus, which are central seed of the mandala as an intense concentration of the research. Literally, these bindus are the intense concentration of energy. Second, the circles symbolise the whole and completeness. I used three layers of circles in the mandala. Third, the squares are used for describing the physical world and direction: north, west, east and south which may have connected the various worldviews of urban youth. Finally, the perimeters are outer circles of the mandala, which create boundaries of discussion (Tenzin-Dolma, 2008).

I used the notion of mandala more than an image. It is a philosophy and worldview for me, which I used for understanding the cosmos and belief system of the urban youth who are living in a complex web of city life. I made an attempt to unpack such complexities of city life and its influence on everyday life of urban youth via the worldview of Mandala. Moreover, mandala creates a pattern to understand the temporal and spatial belief of human and their consciousness because it is a map of the cosmos and whole universe (Vira & Chandra, 1995). Mandala in the Buddhist tradition has been represented by various names to deal with the cosmic consciousness such as Tathagatagarbha, Tathata, Dharmadhatu (Tucci, 1969). However, here, my interpretations are worldlier like Bhavachakra. Perhaps, the notion of using Mandala in this research may not serve the purpose of attaining salvation like in Buddhist tradition. Though the idea of Mandala in the Upanishad was interpreted as a form of darsan (Tucci, 1969), which leads towards the light from darkness, from unreal to real and from illusion to clarity (Tucci, 1969), the idea, here, is used in describing everyday urban life of the youth.

Epistemic Ambivalence of Mandala

Mandala epistemology gives creative, artistic, and decolonial (or Postcolonial) space for narrative researcher under the broader framework of qualitative research. The evolution of qualitative research from early realist ethnography to fictional collage study, several modes of inquiry have emerged, experimented and applied in academia. Denzin and Lincoln (1994) traced out the history of qualitative research and its development along with the contemporary theories and philosophies. The evolution of qualitative research gradually seeks the local modes of representation with logics and genres (Saldana, 2015; Taylor, Taylor, & Luitel, 2012). In this regard, decolonial research tradition appears to expand the horizon of qualitative research (Smith, 1999), rejecting the hegemony of Western Modern Ways of thinking. Some radical views of qualitative research asked its readers to “imagine a world without data, a world without methods, a world without hegemonic politics of evidences, a world where no one counts, a world without end” (Denzin, 2013). In this line, I envisioned Mandala as an epistemic ambivalence to portray the complexities of everyday urban life as a transformative approach.

Arguing Mandala as epistemic ambivalence, here, let me start the notion of understanding real/unreal and surreal world of cities in the globe. Epistemic ambivalence has been interpreted right from the beginning of the history of Hindu civilization, where the Mandala is supposed to balance Prakirti and Purusha, Samsara and Nirvana and Dukha and Mokshya. In this line, epistemic ambivalence of Mandala creates a hybrid space to create dialectics of technocratic prosperity and cultural spiritual embodiments. Mandala itself is a tool to achieve spiritual being inside the physical body of human, creating wholeness. Mandala itself represents the symbol of concentration rather than measurement. In this regard, Mandala gives us space for insight, healing and self-expression as Fincher (1991) opines. Moreover, Mandala offers to design integral research as Taylor et al. (2012) imagine, including the useful features of all existing paradigms. In doing so, we can develop the sense of awareness following any other emergent traditions. According to Sattler (2008), for holistic worldview, the world is an integrated whole, and thus, an organism is also integrated. This integration makes it organic and dynamic (p. 53). In this line, I demonstrate that the transformative space of research is created by applying Mandala through order in chaos, juncture in disjuncture, and rupture in system.

Creating Order in Chaos: Relational Episteme

Usually, the research journey starts in chaos. We cannot be as clear as we need to be in the initial stage of research but we are always in search of order. All research issues start with chaos. As a PhD student, I was struggling to select the research topic, and specifying its scope in the beginning. I used the metaphor of Mandala to search inner and outer orders of human life. I believe that human life starts with chaos. The circle of Mandala allows us to explore the ideas of balance, and coherence in chaos and complexities. Colours of

mandala help to describe the human nature and behaviours. Various shapes and sizes in mandala create a microcosm of aspects of human complexities. Bell (2014) believes, “The mandala is more than a map of the city. It is a social and political ideology, a description of the order of the universe, which is repeated in a well-ordered city here on earth” (p. 54).

Believing the nature of holistic nature of reality based on the post ontological assumption, the everyday life of youth is reflected via relational being, spatial being, temporal being, and relative being. Trungpa (2011) believes, “to begin with, we should discuss the idea of orderly chaos, which is the mandala principle. It is orderly because it comes in a pattern; it is chaos because it is confusing to work with that order” (p. 1). I started thinking the whole life as an orderly chaos. I always find myself as a part of Kathmandu, though I have migrated from a village. Then I learnt to follow the ways of being and living in Kathmandu. In this line, I understand everyday life of urban youth as a relational being. I am relational to the youth, city and its space to know everyday life of urban youth. I explored the transformative possibilities of relational being in research or re-envisioning knowledge as co-creation (Gergen, 2009, p. 201). My ways of understating city life might be guided by the ‘relational aesthetics’ (Springgay, Irwin, & Kind, 2008). I showed how I understood the everyday life of urban youth as relational aesthetic.

Moreover, I understand that everyday life forms the spatial being. Spatial ways of knowing might have emerged with the interaction of youth and the space in Kathmandu. Youth are struggling to survive in Kathmandu, they want to earn more, get food, clothes, and shelter, more rooms and more space. These urban youth are like artists who lived their life in Kathmandu contesting and negotiating the urban space. In other words, I understood, these youth create the meaning of life with the engagement and interaction with the ways of living and doing in Kathmandu. Circles of mandala allowed me to know the everyday life of youth, its balance and coherence in the chaotic city life. Possibly, it embraced epistemic pluralism (Richardson, 2000) to understand both a partial, local, and/or historical knowledge of knowing of urban youth.

Reflecting back on my ways of knowing city life along with youth, it is all blended with my socio-cultural and spiritual being. I believe that urban youth perform material and spiritual, sensible and sensual, violent and peaceful kind of activities as an integral form of understanding in global and local Kathmandu. Likewise, mandala seems to be closer to the integral epistemology (Wilber, 1998), provoking me to explore the ways of understating holistic city life of youth. Observing such ways of everyday life, I sensed the mosaic flavour in studying urbanism and their everyday life. I talked to the colourful people – colour of occupation, colour of caste/ethnicity, colour of geography, colour of interest, colour of aim, colour of name, colour of fame and many other colours blended in urban development and urbanism.

This epistemological assumption might have been shaped and reshaped by the individuals in constructing a personal and unique reality with the several archetypes as Jung (1964) believed. These archetypes create the cities more heterogeneous in terms of many colours. These colours are created among the people living in the urban area, which may help to explore the situated knowledge of Kathmandu. It may enable me to understand the particular situation and context of urban youth in Kathmandu.

Such everyday life activities of urban youth might have been embedded in their sub conscious mind, which is related to the purity. It is also likely that such purity might have been envisioned by modern anthropocentric development. Each of these Buddha's is the symbolic embodiment of a particular quality of the primordial purity. Buddha Amitabh, for instance, displays its power to help the dying. Each main Buddha is accompanied by an entourage relative to that Buddha's activity. At this level, mandalas are maps of the awakened psyche; the geometry of enlightenment (Walcott, 2006).

In this regard, I used mandala as epistemological understanding which gives insight that everyday life activities are circular and always like to enter into the center of city to adapt their life. In this regard, mandala always inspires us to unpack the interconnectedness of center and periphery of the city construct. In so doing, I became more relational of exploring everyday life of urbanyouth.

Mandala helped me to be an artist, not only to present drawing and chart but to use culturally relevant art form in the research in order to support cultural links within participants' stories to foster a more meaningful research experience (Blodgett et al., 2013). I illuminated complex and chaotic urban youth life via artistic expressions.

Contemplation on mandala is a spiritual journey for the Tibetan Buddhist. Buddhist tradition relates the notion of mandala for the nirvana, liberating from all the material values and heading to unify with the god. The goal of the Tibetan Buddhists is to become awakened or to experience Tharpa. The awakening process of connecting with the mandala penetrates body, mind and soul for Nirvana. As a research tool, I used mandala for the contemplation as Buddhist monk to generate stories of youth, exploring how they move in the circle of the city, and evocating their narration in the circle of time and space.

Juncture in Disjuncture: Assemblage Episteme

Mandala helps to bring the consciousness of urban youth which is reflected in their everyday life of Kathmandu, as Eagan (1999) opined, "Mandala symbolizes the instinctive



Figure 1. Mandala Image

human urge to create condition of wholeness and harmony” (p. 4). Believing mandala as path of wholeness of everyday life of urban youth in Kathmandu helps me to create an archaic meaning of everyday life. Mandalas help me to connect inner and outer world of urban youth. The Rig Veda constructed its ten books as the form of the Mandalam to praise and glorify the gods and nature reconciliation. In this line, I believe that urban youth in Kathmandu reconciled their everyday life appreciating the urban ways of living. In this regard, I take mandala as the assemblage which presents several stories of urban youth and their everyday life. These kinds of assemblages are unique and mythical. As in the Rig Veda, these unique stories of wisdom of praising gods and nature have been neatly woven with the help of the mandala, which might have been generated from the oral tradition, ‘Speak together”. Moreover, the archaic meaning of mandala refers to ‘assemblage’, which may relate to the collection of hymns and hero myths” (Eagan, 1999, p. 5). Believing in the notion of assemblage, I explored the assemblages in the everyday life of urban youth.

Readers may see the picture of mandala I designed with the green center circle, which I believe consists of core ideas of balance and harmony. Usually it is believed that the center of the mandala is the inhabitation of God as the form of totality. The square form in the second layer of mandala in red circle depicts the ideas of wall. Traditionally, the space is known as the space of semi god figures. In yet another layer of colourful circle, I created the space of my interpretation where human beings inhabit. This mandala model led me to remind the classical urban theory of Burgess (1967), which presented the city structure, which arranged the people in different social groups.

I believed that youth in Kathmandu were living their real, unreal and surreal life sharing local and global worldviews. I hardly thought everyday life of urban youth as realist because they (we) rarely preferred to live black and white life as humanist qualitative researcher believes. I believe the nature of lived reality of youth in Kathmandu is as a whole like Kathmandu, and its space as configuration of everyday life (Lather & Pierre, 2013). Possibly, I believe in mandala for understanding things as a whole. In this regard, I undertook Kathmandu as a mandala where being, living and learning renounced as a whole.

I have certain values of urban youth who look like dandy and flaneur, who act like punk and rebel and who appear as monsters with their get-up. It might be an outcome of the youth culture but they have some sort of interrelationship with their mainstream culture. Vajrayana emphasizes the role that one’s body and senses can play in the awakening of the mind (Binaya, 2008). In this regard, these dandy youth might be developing awareness of their mind to adapt, assimilate and resist the urban ways of being, learning and living. They might be suffering in the Samsara of urbanism mesocosm that differs from the mesocosm of the ordinary life. They are also searching Nirvana. I was sceptical whether their Nirvana was as Buddha or Kurt Cobain envisioned. Any kind and form of Nirvana would be the creative force of youth agency which drives them to attain freedom and liberation in urban life.

Buddhist tradition uses mandala as a ritual of meditation in the journey of Nirvana from Samsara. Mandala encompasses the composites of the Samsara and Nirvana (Tucci, 1969). Jivatma moves around the layers of circle for enlightenment. The whole process of moving around the circle of time, space and consciousness for attaining the Nirvana is the mandala. In this process, a lot of endeavour is needed for human beings to raise the level of consciousness. The layers of consciousness move in and around the circles and goes towards the center. The mandala has four gates in four directions for entering into another layer of consciousness and leading into the center. In this regard, mandala helps us to connect physical consciousness with the spiritual awareness. As a meditation practitioner, I think mandala is used also for external expressions to explore the universe within the self.

In this line, I used the notion of wheel, unlike Buddha's wheel of life and death, and before death and after life, but as the description of movement of ever going everyday life activities. The notion of wheel is connected with the temporal and spatial activities and consciousness of urban youth in city.

Whole in Fragments and Vice Versa: Integral Episteme

Can we call it that human life is blended with socio-cultural and spiritual being of time and space? I believe human being perform material and spiritual, sensible and sensual, violent and peaceful kind of activities as an integral form of understanding. Likewise, mandala seems to be closer to the integral epistemology (Wibler, 1998), which provoked me to explore the ways of understating holistic human life.

Mandala approach helps to create order via its dynamic and self-referential ways of knowing, which might transform the ways of thinking and believing. Such epistemic ambivalent assumption might have been shaped and reshaped by individuals in constructing personal and unique realities. In such ambivalence, Mandala creates the integral research space beyond and within the understanding of research paradigms.

In this regard, let me give an example. We can start research from the green interpretive circle at the stage of incubation. When it gradually emerges, it is blended with other several colours of circles. Gradually it prepares us to think of using ontological multi-paradigmatic research designs, mainly the paradigms of interpretivism, criticalism, postmodernism and integralism. The interpretive paradigm as a green colour enabled me to employ emergence and inter-subjective features of inquiry. The red colour of Mandala offered a critical outlook needed to identify the research problem, to reflect upon my experiences as an urban resident, as an urban teacher, and to make my lifetime's subjectivities transparent to readers. The paradigm of postmodernism acted to bring the colourful experiences of youth via multiple genres for cultivating different aspects of my experiences of human life. Integralism, likewise, created as inclusive urban youth activities in Kathmandu.

Within/out multi-paradigmatic design space, Mandalic research space helps us to generate the research text of my human life and history (as per need). It also helps us

to generate new knowledge via a host of innovative epistemologies that have the goal of deepening understanding of everyday life practices of youth by examining them critically, identifying underpinning assumptions, and reconstructing them through scholarly interpretations and envisioning. Such innovative epistemologies challenge the anthropological accounts of others (Gegeo & Watson-Gegeo, 2001) However, I sensed indigenous epistemology to understand such youth in Kathmandu. The research frameworks I applied is unlikely to follow the Western Modern forms of research, reasoning, and interpreting. In this regard, the Mandala epistemology “distinguishes between these outsider theories and accounts of other people’s knowledge, on the one hand, and cultural insiders ways of theorizing knowledge, on the other” (Gegeo & Watson-Gegeo, 2001). Similarly, the idea of host epistemologies are the representation of the urban youth’s ways of thinking and of creating, reformulating, and theorizing about knowledge via traditional discourses and media of communication, anchoring the truth of the discourse in culture (Gegeo & Watson-Gegeo, 2001). The notion of mandala has been emerged as Barrett (2016) draws an attention on the relational methodology, which emerged from the reflexive and culturally appropriate enquiry process.

I started my research from the interpretive circle, and the circle was green at the stage of incubation. When it gradually emerged, it was blended with other several circles. Initially, I was thinking of using multi-paradigmatic research design, mainly drawn from the narrative, decolonial and artistic research space. In order to carry out both urban youth everyday life activities, it could best be portrayed with the Mandala metaphor which would lead to create an inclusive research space. The narrative research space seemed to be more interpretive, where I became more inter-subjective while exploring the meaning of everyday life of urban youth. The red colour of Mandala offered a critical outlook needed to identify the research problem, to reflect upon my experiences as an urban resident, as an urban youth and to make my lifetime’s subjectivities transparent to readers under decolonial/indigenous research space. Likewise, artistic space acted to bring the colourful experiences of youth via multiple genres for cultivating different aspects of my experiences of living in urban life. Further, with the space of integralism, I envisioned inclusive urban youth activities in Kathmandu.

Post Script: Epistemic Indeterminacy for Transformation

Reflecting on the epistemic indeterminacy of Mandala, it interprets reciprocal uncertainty between position and momentum. Barad (2007) describes the notion of indeterminacy as “we cannot know something definite about something for which there is nothing definite to know” (p. 118). In such a situation, I used the notion of indeterminacy not to challenge the traditional concept of observability but also the dominant so called scientific and humanist paradigms of research. In this regard, mandala as a symbol gives the sense of local and indigenous epistemology to understand particular group of people.

Moreover, the notion of indeterminacy helps research to identify some local epistemologies to study the group of people. I used such epistemic indeterminacy to study urban youth which possibly traces to study any particular group of people and community from the transformative approaches.

Mandala gave me a lot of space for being relational, local and artistic. Mandala is itself an art. Thus, it allowed me to be artistic in terms of thinking, presenting and doing research. I used artistic expression and portraits of youth in the research to illuminate the complex social realities of urban youth. Ambiguity or openness can be revealed via arts informed research as being more expressive and contextual of urban youth. It helps to build empathy and engagement with the readers. Within an artistic research space I might have applied an aesthetic form of 'data' presentation and meaning making process. Arts based research: (1) enables me to use more affective experiences, imagination and emotion as well as intellect; (2) gives space for interpretations of my participants' experience; (3) attends to the role of form in shaping meaning; and (4) exists in the tensions of blurred boundaries (Finley, 2008).

I employed arts-based research space for making available new forms of representation such as (i) literary genres of impressionist writing, autobiographical writing, storying, poetry, ethno drama, screenplay and fiction, and (ii) visual imagery painting, sketching and photography (Taylor & Medina, 2013). I employed field-based or art based research designs in order to understand their perceptions, with different logics and genres such as poetic, dialectic, and narrative logics.

Thus far, my methodological heuristics has emerged in the fieldwork. My engagement in the field has created the ways of portraying the voice and everyday activities of urban youth via newer approaches of storying their lived experience, probing them, interpreting in a meaningful way, and generating their ideas. I have experimented with my expressions, mode of presentation and theorizing. I am aware of a postmodernist vantage point to illuminate the complexities of urban youth and their everyday life. However, I can't claim that I am a postmodernist who ruptures the hierarchy between the center and the periphery. Instead I deal with the center and periphery from the mandala perspective. Mandala in cities are reserved for the rich and affluent among the various groups of youth, rich, poor, shy, hardworking, lazy, and many others. The city continues to provide the prime socio-spatial context with which economic and political elites and ordinary people construct and act out the processes of disinvestment (Gothman, 2001, p. 1). In this context, I believe in realities that may explore the power relationship as a critical factor in the urban centers. My understanding, as a solipsist, of urban centres has eventually empowered me to create a distinct image of urban youth in Kathmandu.

References

- Arguelles, J., & Arguelles, M. (1972). *Mandala*. Berkeley, CA: Sharabhala.
- Barad, K. (2007). *Meeting the universe halfway: Quantum physics and the entanglement of matter and meaning*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Barrett, E. (2016, January). Relationality and ethical know-how in Indigenous research. *iDARE 2016: Proceedings of the Creative Arts and the Ethics of Innovation Conference*, 1-15.
- Bell, T. (2014). *Kathmandu*. New Delhi, India: Penguin Random House.
- Binaya, (2008). *Vedanta Darshan*. New Delhi, India: Diamond Pocket Books.
- Blodgett, A. T., Coholic, D. A., Schinke, R. J., McGannon, K. R., Peltier, D., & Pheasant, C. (2013). Moving beyond words: Exploring the use of an arts-based method in Aboriginal community sport research. *Qualitative Research in Sport, Exercise and Health*, 5(3), 312-331.
- Brauen, M. (2009). *Mandala – Sacred circle in Tibetan Buddhism*. Arnoldsche Verlagsanstalt: Stuttgart, Germany.
- Burgess, E. W. (1967). *The growth of the city: An introduction to a research project*. London, England: Ardent Media.
- Denzin, N. K. (2013). The death of data? *Cultural Studies ↔ Critical Methodologies*, 13(4), 353–356. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1177/1532708613487882>
- Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (1994). *Handbook of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Eagan, J. (1999). *The poem as a mandala: A search for a fundamental pattern in poetry* (Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation). The University of Mississippi, United State.
- Fincher, S. F. (1991). *Creating mandalas: For insight, healing and self expression*. London, England: Shambhala.
- Finley, S. (2008). Arts-based research. In J. G. Knowles & A. L. Cole (Eds.), *Handbook of the arts in qualitative research* (pp. 71-81). London, England: Sage.
- Gegeo, D. W., & Watson-Gegeo, K. A. (2001). “How we know”: Kwara’ae rural villagers doing indigenous epistemology. *The Contemporary Pacific*, 13(1), 55-88.
- Gergen, K. J. (2009). *Relational being: Beyond self and community*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Gothman, K. F. (2001). Critical perspective on urban redevelopment. *Research in Urban Sociology*, 6, 1-31.
- Jung, C. G. (1964). *Man and his symbols*. New York, NY: Doubleday and Company.
- Lather, P., & Pierre, E. A. (2013). Post-qualitative research. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 26(6), 629-633.

- Longchenpa, A. (2001). *Treasure trove of scriptural transmission* (R. Barron, Trans). California, CA: Padma Publishing.
- Malandra, G. H. (1993). *Unfolding a mandala: The Buddhist cave temples in Ellora*. New Delhi, India: Sri Satguru Publication.
- Richardson, L. (2000). Evaluating ethnography. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 6(2), 253-255.
- Saldana, J. (2015). *Thinking qualitatively: Methods of mind*. London, England: Sage.
- Sattler, R. (2008). *Wibler's AQUL map and beyond*. Retrieved from www.beyondWibler.ca
- Smith, L. T. (1999). *Decolonizing methodologies: Research and indigenous peoples*. London, England: Zed Books.
- Springgay, S., Irwin, R. L., & Kind, S. (2008). *A/r/tographers and living inquiry. Handbook of the arts in qualitative research*. New York, NY: Sage.
- Taylor, P. C., & Medina, M. N. D. (2013). Educational research paradigms: From positivism to multiparadigmatic. *The journal of Meaning-Centered Education*, 1(2), 1-13.
- Taylor, P. C., Taylor, E. L., & Luitel, B. C. (2012). Multi-paradigmatic transformative research as/for teacher education: An integral perspective. B. J. Fraser, K. Tobin, & C. J. McRobbie (Eds.), *Second international handbook of science education* (pp. 373-387). Dordrecht, the Netherlands: Springer.
- Tenzin-Dolma, L. (2008). *Healing mandalas: 30 Inspiring meditation to soothe your mind, body and soul*. London, England: Duncan Baird Publisher.
- Trungpa, C. (2011). *Orderly chaos: The mandala principle*. Boston, MA: Shambhala.
- Tucci, G. (1969). *The theory and practice of the mandala* (A. H. Brodrick, Trans.) London, England: Rider and Company.
- Vira, R., & Chandra, L. (1995). *Tibetan mandalas*. New Delhi, India: Aditya Prakashan.
- Walcott, S. M. (2006). Mapping from a different direction: Mandala as sacred spatial visualization. *Journal of Cultural Geography*, 23(2), 71-88.
- Wilber, K. (1998). *The essential Wilber*. Boston, MA: Shambhala.